



## REPORT

### CITIZENSHIP SERIES

#### TRANSPARENT AND ACCOUNTABLE CITIES: INNOVATIVE SOLUTIONS FOR MUNICIPAL MANAGEMENT AND FINANCE

#### CAPACITY BUILDING WORKSHOP

Madrid, 9 – 10 February 2017

#### Organizers:



#### in partnership with:



#### Thanks to the support of:



## TABLE OF CONTENTS

BACKGROUND	3	5.3. <i>Debate: key messages and recommendations</i>	22
2017 MADRID WORKSHOP	4	SPECIAL SESSIONS	23
OPENING SESSION: INSTITUTIONAL WELCOME AND INTRODUCTION	6	6.1. <i>Focus in Spain: a political vision about the challenges of open local government</i>	23
THEMATIC SESSIONS	9	6.2. <i>SMART geeks: technological applications for cities</i>	25
4.1. <i>Session 1 - Municipal finances: innovative solutions to increase transparency in managing public money</i>	9	CLOSING REMARKS AND PRESENTATION OF URBAN-GLASS	28
4.2. <i>Session 2 - Innovative solutions for transparent public services</i>	12	ANNEXES	
4.3. <i>Session 3 - Innovative solutions to govern with the citizen: increased participation and citizen engagement in city management</i>	14	Annex 1: Agenda	
4.4. <i>Session 4 - Innovative solutions to increase local capacities in the fight against corruption</i>	18	Annex 2: List of participants	
WORKING GROUPS	20	Annex 3: Brief Bios	
5.1. <i>Innovative solutions for citizen engagement in fighting corruption</i>	20		
5.2. <i>Innovative solutions for municipal finances and public services.</i>	21		

## 1. BACKGROUND

Launched in June 2014 in Santander, the [Uraía Platform](#) (*which means citizenship in Swahili*) has become a key instrument for cities and their partners in addressing the challenges of implementing innovation in municipal management through the use of SMART technologies. The objective of Uraía is to support cities in implementing SMART strategies to improve municipal finances, service management efficiency, increase transparency and accountability by offering opportunities to share experience, build capacity and develop pilot projects as well as applications. Today, the platform constitutes a network of 100 partners from around the world, including cities, their associations, research institutions and the private sector.

The continuous introduction of SMART technologies for city management is producing an impact at the local public administration; this aspect presents both opportunities and challenges due to the rapidity of change and the difficulties for public administration to follow with the pattern of transformation. Contemporarily, and thanks to the use of mobiles, citizens all over the world are increasingly demanding information on how public goods are managed; and correspondingly local governments are increasingly demanded to deliver more and better. Uraía's members recognise the need to communicate more with their citizens in order and to introduce and increase transparency in the management of public services, including their cost, efficiency on how and where taxes are allocated.

Uraía is a project of [UN-Habitat](#), the United Nations Human Settlement Programme and [FMDV](#), the Global Fund for the development of cities.

Once a year, the members of Uraía meet up to discuss a topic that is a priority in their agendas and jointly elaborate guidelines, collect practices and assess projects with common elements of interest. The past editions of these "Citizenship Series" events include:

- ✓ [Santander, June 2014: Launch of the Uraía Platform, Marketplace and project design exercise](#)
- ✓ [Oslo, June 2015: Public-Private Partnerships negotiation for SMART city management](#)
- ✓ [Nicosia, April 2016: SMART technologies and the municipal budget](#)

In 2017, the Uraía Platform workshop focused on how cities can use SMART technologies in order to be more transparent and accountable to their citizens. A two day workshop under theme of "Transparent and accountable cities: innovative solutions for municipal management and finance" was organized in collaboration with the Spanish Federation of Municipalities and Provinces (FEMP).

This report recounts the exchanges, discussions developed and shared during that event.

## 2. 2017 MADRID WORKSHOP



The [Uraía Platform](#) and the [Spanish Federation of Municipalities and Provinces \(FEMP\)](#) have shared the interest and commitment to the development of new models of open and collaborative governance that foster transparency and accountability in urban management. Acknowledging that networking among local administrations and stakeholders has become an essential platform to find solutions and exchange instruments that can improve the design and development of public policies Uraía offered a space for exchange and debate on different experiences to promote innovation as key factor for city's transparency.

Cities and partners were encouraged to present their experiences on the innovative solutions on transparency in municipal management, in an open call launched on November 2016. The call obtained an unprecedented number of positive responses with over 130 candidate experiences, showing the relevance on the topic for city's leaders and stakeholders and the great interest for learning opportunities on the matter. The selection process was done according to a specified criteria taking into account geographic and gender balance with the broadest extent possible, as well as thematic focus of the experiences.

Consequently, the workshop titled "*Transparent and accountable cities: innovative solutions for municipal management and finance*" brought together 80 representatives of local governments and their partners (network of cities, civil society and international organizations, service providers from the private sector, universities, etc.) from all around the world.

The objective of the workshop was to present and exchange experiences on innovative initiatives that local governments and their partners are developing to implement mechanisms for transparency, accountability and participation in urban management.

During two days, participants had a chance to discuss different approaches and mechanism with which municipalities can profit from, advantages of innovation and technology in preventing corruption and mismanagement in urban settings. Additionally, participants had the opportunity to discover available

SMART solutions that can have significant impact on transparency and can improve their communication with the citizens.

The panellists and participants explored aspects of innovative solutions on four different thematic trails:

1. **Thematic trail BLUE – Municipal finances: innovative solutions to increase transparency in managing public money.**
2. **Thematic trail GREEN: Innovative solutions for transparent public services.**
3. **Thematic trail YELLOW – Innovative solutions to govern with the citizen: increased participation and citizen engagement in city management.**
4. **Thematic trail RED - Innovative solutions to increase local capacities in the fight against corruption.**

Their presentations showed practical examples of how these initiatives were implemented in several countries and brought to the table detailed approaches and specific tools. Each session culminated in a debate moderated by specialists on these relevant themes.

Additionally, participants had a chance to gather in small groups to exchange their own experiences and opinions about innovative solutions for citizen engagement in fighting corruption, as well as innovative solutions for municipal finances and public services. These recommendations were shared and analysed by all participants in a plenary session.

The final day, opened the floor for a political session with the focus on Spain as well as a specific space to present city applications and tools.

The workshop closed with a resume of the main challenges identified during the past days, followed by a presentation of the “Urban - GLASS” (Global-Local Accountability Support System), and an open discussion about how this new initiative could support addressing existing needs on the specific topic of transparency, accountability and participation in urban management.

The discussions and outcomes of the workshop will feed into the transparency chapter of the recent publication of Uraía on **“The impact of SMART technologies in the municipal budget: increase revenue and reduce expenses for better public services”**. This separate chapter will systematize the exchanges, case studies, challenges, opportunities and views shared by decision makers who face similar situations regarding the pressing need to address the citizen’s demand for transparency in more innovative ways





### 3. OPENING SESSION: INSTITUTIONAL WELCOME AND INTRODUCTION



The workshop commenced with an institutional welcome by **David Lucas**, the Mayor of Mostoles and President of the International Committee of the Spanish Federation of Municipalities and Provinces (FEMP). He remarked that the workshop was a great opportunity to advance the consolidation of the Uraía Platform as a useful space for municipalities and partners to find innovative, valid, effective and efficient solutions in order to respond to citizens' demands.

During his speech, he recalled the long history of collaboration and work between FEMP and UN-Habitat and their commitment to strengthening of local governments' capacities and the improvement of management through the development of projects as well as exchange of good practices and knowledge.

He argued that faced with infinite needs and limited resources, local governments around the world face similar challenges and are constantly in search of practical solutions. Therefore, platforms such as Uraía do an essential work in strengthening local governments' capacities by fostering mutual learning and networking between local governments and stakeholders in order to exchange instruments that can improve the design and development of local public policies including the provision of public services.

In his words, the Uraía workshop represented, a perfect opportunity to share experiences in the use of SMART technologies for transparency, good governance and the effective provision of municipal public services so that local government' actions can effectively respond to the needs of the citizens.

He recalled that as part of the permanent action on this area, FEMP has undertaken an important task in supporting the Spanish Network of SMART Cities (RECI) and the IMPULSO Network. After the introduction, representatives of Uraía and FEMP gave an overall overview of the objectives and expected outcomes of the workshop.

**Diana López Caramazana**, Head of Local government and decentralization Unit of UN-Habitat, stated that the workshop represented an important field of learning and embodied a unique occasion to share lessons learned and positive experiences from different perspectives to take further steps towards achieving more transparent and open cities. She commented on how the Uraía Platform was launched with FMDV and with the support of FEMP in Santander in 2014, under the idea that the use of SMART technologies represented a huge opportunity for local governments to take advantage of learn more about.

She recalled that due to the change of paradigm and the introduction of new technologies in our daily lives, the way the citizens are communicating with the local administrations has drastically changed presenting, a new opportunity to channel the citizenship, among other things. Hence, the challenge for municipal management now is to adapt to these changes and take advantage of innovation in order to find better means to communicate with the citizens and improve city management.

Since it is not easy for local governments to keep the path of innovation, the work of Uraía is to support them by identifying new trends and practices as well as facilitate spaces for dialogue and exchange to share experiences and learn from the success and failure of others.

Initially, the Uraía discussion started with the [Public-Private partnerships](#) for SMART city management and eventually moved into the [impact of SMART technologies in the municipal budget](#) during the second year and in order to show how they can help municipalities in managing their finances in an improved setting by increasing revenue and reducing expenses for better public services. This year the issue observed is transparency and accountability as the necessary link between municipal finance (income) and service provision (delivery).

Lopez commented on the necessity of local governments in building trust in the citizens so they can believe that municipalities are able to deliver the services and be able to “do their job”. Citizens need to see the taxes they pay reflected in the services they receive and in solutions of their needs.

In the developing world, this problematic issue has ended up in some cases of informality, where citizens do not rely on the public sector for the provision of services, are forced to pay for them in the informal market and feel discouraged to pay taxes, without local taxes, the administration cannot provide the called services. She added that for taxes to be transformed into real services and create better communication with the citizens, it is necessary to explain better what the municipalities do and how much its work costs (e.g. the prices of a traffic light as well as how many lives it saves to have it).

Local Governments need to communicate better with the citizens and SMART technologies presents great opportunities to improve the link with citizens and increase service management efficiency. Nevertheless, the municipalities need to know how to use them, hence the Uraía workshop presents a good scenario to help municipalities understand better and profit from the opportunities the provided. She concluded her introductory remarks by outlining the objectives and methodology of the meeting.

Following the presentation, **Jean François Habeau**, Executive Director of the Global Fund for Cities Development (FMDV), presented the Fund, a global alliance to promote finance and investment solutions for local governments. He highlighted FMDV’s works with national governments in promoting decentralization processes that can guarantee adequate financial resources to local governments. With this aim, it provides technical assistance, harmonization of policies, international coordination and several programs.

FMDV’s aims to facilitate multi-stakeholder mobilization, encounter and collaboration through the establishment of and participation in platforms and thematic forums, as well as the creation of dedicated networks and communities of practice. Therefore, by supporting the Uraía Platform, FMDV plans to improve local efficiency in managing resources and delivering public services by using smart technologies, among other solutions.

To date, Uraía has brought together more than 100 partners from local communities and companies. The next goals are to keep supporting capacity building activities, such as the workshop, to open up the platform to more local authorities and to diversify the services, in particular to map out the technical and financial partners that can be requested by local authorities. Furthermore, he reaffirmed the serious commitment of all the partners to

lead and actively participate in every initiative related to how they can build well financed, better managed and more transparent and accountable cities.

Finally, **Juana López Pagán**, Director International and European projects of the FEMP, started by pointing out the relevance of Uraía not just as a platform to discuss innovation but also an important space of collaboration between administrations, the private sector and experts. According to her, Uraía has facilitated and promoted a fundamental scenario for different actors to reflect and exchange experiences on the different mechanisms to improve local public policies and actions and to foster participation of the citizens in decisions that affect them.

The Open government *phenomena* is marked by the need of citizens to have greater transparency and better access to information regarding their governments and its performance. Ultimately, this translates into the citizens feeling that the public powers operate with opacity as public administrations are used to solving their issues in secrecy, and where information is handled by a few. In the current context, the demand from the citizens and the existence and emergence of new mechanisms of dialogue and participation, also supported by new technologies, have made a big impact in the field of public governance.

She mentioned that the "open" movement recognize the need to rethink the way public management operates, and the way the citizens participate in additions to the mechanisms of communication between them. In order to benefits from this new model of governance, it is necessary to recognize the talent of governments and the talent emerging in the citizens. Open government is a public power that opens up to the talent of society and seeks to explain what it does, how it does it and with what means, against models where there was no way to know *what, when and how*.

She pinpointed the three principles of open government: transparency, participation and collaboration, emphasizing that transparency without a purpose and without accompanying the traceability of public decisions does not reach its full meaning. She recalled the importance of understanding participation in the sense of citizen involvement in the design of the decisions to be implemented and in the phase of the formulation of public policies. Finally, she mentioned collaboration as means of co-creation of public policies.

In the context of technological innovation, an Open Government can benefit from the possibilities brought by new technologies by having better channels of interlocution and mechanisms for direct dialogue. However an open government is not an e-government. Open government is a model in which citizens are at the center of political action, hence it goes far beyond electronic governance, information portals and open data, even though these tools are a basic condition of an open government that wants to promote collaboration. Despite the benefits of this new form of governance, there are still challenges with its implementation. This is why the value of open government should be promoted and disseminated, networks need to raise awareness and help local governments that want to join this mechanism to do better.

Lastly, she reminded that the exercise that is carried out in the Uraía workshop is an important way of raising awareness of these values of open government and the practices shared will increase the vision and capacities of local governments to have more open, transparent and accountable local governments.



## 4. THEMATIC SESSIONS

This workshop counted with four thematic sessions that focused on the different dimensions in which innovative initiatives are helping local governments and its partners promote and achieve more transparency, accountability and participation in urban management. During the sessions, participants also addressed the success and risks factors to consider in implementing local policies on transparency and citizen participation in city management and the different strategies and available tools to prevent corruption in urban development. From analyzing the relation between urban governance, local democracy and increasing transparency, the sessions also shed light on lessons from the current practice taking place in countries located in different regions.

The presenters brought to the discussion active examples of how to increase trust in public sector, fight informal access to urban and basic services and to actively involve of all social, economic actors as well as citizens in the fight against corruption and the creation of more open and transparent cities.

### SESSION 1 – MUNICIPAL FINANCES: INNOVATIVE SOLUTIONS TO INCREASE TRANSPARENCY IN MANAGING PUBLIC MONEY

In this session different contributions to the theme were presented from the experience of different institutions and local governments: Inter-American Development Bank (IDB), Nicosia Municipality (Cyprus), Jakarta Capital City Government (Indonesia) and ENDA ECOPOP.

**Huáscar Eguino**, Leader Specialist in Fiscal and Municipal Management of the Inter-American Development Bank, clarified that the IDB is a development bank that finances projects and infrastructures and also combines three different types of products: (i) financial products including loans and non-reimbursable technical cooperation; (ii) knowledge management and (iii) technical assistance in policy design. Approximately, 30% of all operations of the IDB are dedicated to institutional development from different perspectives: state modernization, fiscal and municipal management and innovation management and technology.



The IDB has a broad research agenda in the areas of public policy and fiscal and innovation; working in the following areas:

- 1) Electronic invoice (concentrated in VAT and complementary products used specifically in the fight against corruption).
- 2) New financial management systems (integration of systems -budget accounting, treasury and purchases- using cloud-based systems and block chain).
- 3) New Public Investment Systems (modernization of the systems through integration of public works with system of budget and acquisitions involving citizen participation).
- 4) E-Procurement acquisitions of goods, services and infrastructure.
- 5) Modernization of Tax Administrations.
- 6) Land Administration Models.

- 7) Digital government and municipal fiscal management (support to local governments to modernize its management using technology).

According to Eguino, the work of the IDB regarding best practices on the topics related to the workshop can be categorized in three main lines:

- 1) Replication of practices from the national to the subnational level: As in the case of the National Tax and Social Identification System (SINTyS) in Argentina, where the system allows the integration of database of federal programs debugging information for the allocation of subsidies for the beneficiaries. Replication has been carried out in 10 subnational governments (provinces) within the framework of the "Fiscal strengthening program for provincial Governments".
- 2) Replication of the subnational level practices to the national level: the example given was the initiative "Sigamos Medellín", an application created by the municipal government for citizens to locate public works being developed and to follow up on its execution. Through an interactive system, citizens can make claims or grade the public works. Based on this experience, IDB has scaled the practice and implemented nationally in Peru with the New Public Investment System. This initiative has made the system more open allowing the visualization of the public investments at territorial level. MIT Lab is developing telephone applications to allow citizens to see and follow up investments and to help government officials to monitor the gaps and failures of the infrastructure in the territory.
- 3) Horizontal replication: systematization of good practices for replication in networks of subnational governments. Within the Project "Urban network for innovation in municipal management" done with Mercociudades, a survey was conducted on the degree of development of digital government in 213 municipal governments and later on an index of digital government was developed. With these results, a ranking by categories of cities was established and the applications highlighted in municipal governments with better qualification in composite index were identified. Thus, good practices by category were systematized and will be disseminated through the website of Mercociudades.

Before wrapping up, he stressed on the importance of continuing with the search and systematization of good practices but recommended to refine case selection methodologies that actually have replication potential. He recalled on the importance of having more structured mechanisms and selection methodologies to identify those municipalities that have shown systemic improvements and then identify the tools and innovative instruments that have led to this improvement. Finally, he concluded on the need to quantify and evaluate products and results and to generate empirical evidence on the impacts of digital government projects in order to have a more informed dialogue and to encourage other cities to implement technological tools. In this way, he also insisted on the relevance of evaluating the cost-benefit ratio of technological alternatives (whether it is better to look for in-house development or to replicate an alternative already existing in the market).

**Nikolas Efstathiou**, City Treasurer of Nicosia Municipality (Cyprus) presented the e-Nicosia tool, aimed to increase access to information. This online portal offers a platform where citizens have access to all their taxes, can input remarks and complaints, pay taxes, fines, dues and have online information regarding their properties. The online information service has improved the efficiency of municipal services for Nicosia residents and stakeholders.

The e-Nicosia tool is tailor-made to meet user expectations, requirements, preferences and needs in design and operation of the system. Resolving these issues is critical for the development and operation of new payment systems and future growth of e-Nicosia, he noted. Among the information visible, the citizens can find: property municipal charges, license for planning, building or separation of property, property plot cleaning charge, garbage collection charge, professional tax, professional premises license, alcohol and tobacco license, fines, etc.

He added that one of the challenges identified is the collection of professional tax from all companies registered in Nicosia Municipality. As mandated by Cypriot Municipal Law, “each body that engages in business with the intention of profit in a municipal region has the obligation to register their business with the local authority and pay professional tax”. Due to Cyprus low company tax rate, business owners who are not Cypriot citizens register their companies in the country to take advantage of this situation. The main challenge is that many companies are registered in lawyers’ offices and contact their business through local directors. Lawyers that manage these companies quote fees, quite hefty, that does not include the city’s tax and on occasions are unwilling to pay the municipal tax and avoid payment by either withholding information from local authorities or even applying political pressure.

Finally, he stated that the municipality has done several actions to face these challenges, but both the difficulties of articulation with the central government and the influence exercised by the lobby of the lawyers has not allowed the situation to change leaving the Municipality to lose income from this specific tax. The municipality is searching for new strategies to handle this particular issue.

Bringing the perspective of an Asian city, **Heru Budi Hartono**, Head of Financial and asset management board from Jakarta Capital City Government, (Indonesia) presented the “Accounting Clinic” initiative, a complete and efficient integrated financial information management system for all departments of the municipality.



One of the fundamental objectives of the administration is to direct all of its management in public service to build a modern and livable city in which old problems such as traffic jams, floods, illegal occupations or waste are solved. All these objectives can be done through "a clean, transparent and service-oriented administration". He explained that the Accounting Clinic was born in 2015 as part of the administration’s commitment to promote accountability within the government sector, setting as a target to adopt full cashless transactions for all of its operations in 2016.

Jakarta Capital City Government owns earning potentials and significant asset. The whole potentials can be optimized as financial resources to further develop the city. The asset of Jakarta Capital City Government should be maintained and the expenditure should be controlled to be economically effective and efficient as well as transparent and accountable, he added.

He underlined that the Accounting Clinic has three fundamental objectives: (i) the improvement of policies, system and standard procedures; ii) the improvement of the quality and capacity of human resources, as consultative and educational means for the implementation of accrual-based accounting; and (iii) the improvement of the technology to develop the System itself, such as e-budgets, e-retributions and e-assets.

He concluded by acknowledging that the results of the Accounting Clinic can be perceived in the high levels of trust and reliability of the financial policies, systems and procedures where the system provide reliable and real-time financial information improving the quality and transparency of financial reporting and allowing for an effective and responsible management of assets. Finally, he noted he had also seen results in the improvement of the knowledge and understanding of financial management by their own administration personnel.



Then, **Mamadou Bachir Kanoute**, Executive Coordinator of ENDA ECOPOP and leading the office of International Observatory of Participatory Democracy in Africa (IOPDA), shared the experience of developing the “YTAX” tool.

IOPDA is covering 418 cities in 17 African countries and Enda ECOPOP is a Civil Society Organization that promotes works for a peaceful and united world, a world respectful of human dignity and rights, social justice and cultural diversity, where various resources are fairly distributed and managed in the interest of present and future generations. It works with grassroots communities in advocacy efforts to influence

qualitatively the decisions affecting citizens at different scales of intervention. With this perspective, SMART technologies play an important role of support, inclusion in governance and support for scaling up.

In the African context, financial decentralization remains a major concern for local governments. In recent years, state financial transfers fluctuate, on average, around 3 to 7% of the public budget per year. The mobilization of their own resources, such as tax revenues, remains problematic in most African local governments due to: (I) an obsolete collection system often subjected to fraud and tax evasion; (li) lack of effective control of collected revenues; (lii) lack of information on the taxpayer and communication on the use of the local financial resources collected; and (lv) a lack of transparency on the taxation chain and communication of revenues mobilized in the territory.

It this context, Enda ECOPOP set up a collaborative technological device called "YTAX", a SMART and collaborative technology to improve the mobilization of local resources, increase transparency and combat tax evasion. According to Kanoute, this development is a step forward for the integration of SMART technologies into local development strategies and the anchoring of collaborative and transparent cities.

The YTAX device has helped to: (i) identify and give reliability to the tax base; (ii) ensure control, transparency and accountability on the fiscal chain; (iii) communicate in real time the financial information collected; and (iv) collect and record the different community taxes. The tool operates with a cellphone and a mini printer and is managed by the officials responsible for making the collection on the ground. Taxes are parameterized in the device and the terminal further allows locating the place where the collection was made by GPS. Every time that a transaction is done, officials can visualize the rate, the place and amount charged.

The implementation of this device has made possible to improve transparency in local taxation and have an efficient collection of local taxes. The tool has also allowed to geolocate taxpayers advancing in the fight against tax evasion. Finally, according to Kanoute, the implementation of YTAX has permitted the involvement of citizens through their neighborhood councils strengthening relations of responsibility to excessive “fiscal citizenship” and to foster a governance focused on the needs of citizens and improving the performance of municipal service.

## SESSION 2 - INNOVATIVE SOLUTIONS FOR TRANSPARENT PUBLIC SERVICES

This session highlighted two case studies of cities located in Malaysia and Uganda detailing the processes and challenges faced by both cities while using SMART technologies to improve the link with citizens and increase services management efficiency. The session aimed to shed light on the great opportunities given by the initiatives of transparency and open government as key elements to improve the living conditions of citizens through the provision of efficient and effective services in an open, competitive and fair manner.



During his presentation “WhatsApp monitoring for environmental issues”, **Lih Shyan Lee**, Director of solid waste management and public cleansing of the City of Petaling Jaya City Council (Malaysia) presented a very relevant case regarding the use of TIC for improving the efficiency and transparency in public service delivery, specifically in waste management and public cleaning.

He stressed that the population in Petaling Jaya have high expectations regarding public services, something that does not happen in other Malaysian cities. Waste management and public cleansing (these activities entail road sweeping, waste collection, drainage clearance and water buster) is provided out-sourced through open tender processes (As of today, there are 138 appointed contractors).



He then described the challenges faced by the municipality regarding the efficiency of the service: (i) high expectations combined with limited competency and capacity of contractors; (ii) high levels of complaints and not rapid answer from the administration; (iii) low sense of ownership towards neighborhood; and (iv) lack of a platform to disseminate and communicate information regarding the service.

To respond to those challenges, Lee explained that the city developed an innovative solution based in the use of WhatsApp as a medium of communication to bridge issues of accountability, transparency and expectations. WhatsApp puts in contact the different stakeholders engaged in waste management and public cleansing service delivery (citizens, representative from associations, local officials and government departments, contractors, etc.). It is used to share reports, to communicate the schedule of works and to manage complaints, among others. From October 2014, 68 groups were active for these purposes.

He further explained that WhatsApp was considered as a great option since it was available immediately, it is mobile-based, user friendly and inclusive (all stakeholders can easily access, and no skill development is needed), it is low cost, and it provides real time and geo-related communication and information.

The experience encountered a number of challenges, from ethical and compliance issues to the use for other scopes for waste management, as well as public cleansing and the attitude of public contractors. Additionally, the system is still primitive and focused on information and communication, hence it is very limited for other functions, such as retrieving past records, analyzing data, or coordinating with other existing Management Information Systems (MIS). Finally, in order to have a better impact and development of the tool, he recognized that the city should have enabled connection with existing MIS since the beginning to better select stakeholders to be included in the groups in order to improve representativeness.



Entitled “The Kampala Contract registration module”, the presentation by Agatha **Ainomugisha**, from the Kampala Capital City Authority (Uganda) centered on an innovative procurement system as a solution for providing public services that are more transparent. The presenter focused on the challenges addressed by the city, the solution provided and the lessons learnt from the experience.

The challenge was to improve the cycle of service delivery by offering information and receive feedback from the communities regarding public contracts. This tool is the first



phase in order to develop a full e-procurement system. At the moment, the city has developed a contract management module that focuses on registration of contracts and in the publication on it details and status in a web-based platform.

The platform enables citizens to access information on city infrastructure projects, of its details and status (times, responsibilities and costs details, among others). This includes both ongoing contracts and upcoming projects. The web allows the public to monitor progress and to give feedback and suggestions by using sms, e-mail, Facebook and other social media. Dedicated staff receives and processes this feedback.

The presenter showed the platform how it lists the name of the projects, its categories, costs, contractors, locations, by start and end dates. In using the system, citizens know about the projects, stakeholders are more easily engaged, and there is a reduction in delays thus in costs, fostering transparency and accountability in the procurements' transactions.

The major challenges faced by the experience included the limited awareness, capacities and skills among citizens, problems in internet accessibility, limited information provided by contractors, inadequate or not integrated channels for feedback (as SMS), and problems with resources, as the limited staff of the municipality.

Finally, as lessons learned, she mentioned that "it would have been decisive to increase awareness of the existence and relevance of the communication channels, to establish reliable feedback and to improve the engagement of stakeholders and all levels".

### SESSION 3 – INNOVATIVE SOLUTIONS TO GOVERN WITH THE CITIZEN: INCREASED PARTICIPATION AND CITIZEN ENGAGEMENT IN CITY MANAGEMENT

Citizens today are increasingly demanding their governments for the development of transparency and anti-corruption initiatives to strengthen information systems and allow for the establishment of effective control systems. Emerging social mobilization is an evidence that citizens want to stop being passive victims of the problem of corruption and mismanagement in order to become partners in implementing solutions.

This issue makes it clear that improving governance systems and mechanisms of accountability at the local level is essential for the establishment of efficient and strong local governments connected to the real demands of their citizens. Furthermore, this session presented three inspiring experiences with the inclusion of citizens in the implementation of transparency solutions from three different points of view: from a Local Government Association (Sri Lanka), a city (Bogotá, Colombia) and the private sector (Microsoft).

After giving a brief introduction about her country, **Ganewattage Deepani Hemanthi Goonasekera**, Chief Executive Officer of the Federation of Sri Lankan Local Government Authorities, presented the work of her Federation that represents the interest of all 335 local councils including Municipalities, Urban Councils and Pradeshiya Sabhas, aims to strengthen the local governments in Sri Lanka.

As part of the work developed by the Federation, she further presented an initiative called the Electronic Citizen Report Cards (eCRC), boosted under the slogan "Better Data means Better Services".



She recalled that in the past, Citizen Report Cards (CRC) were used as a tool to monitor the citizen satisfaction on service delivery. Moreover, the process was costly, time consuming, and sometimes not be very reliable. Additionally, the councils perceived the CRC more as negative reflection of the council services and not as a tool used to improve services. As many of these processes were done by a specific intermediary, the relation between citizens and local governments was prone to be manipulated eroding the purpose of engaging the community in the city's affairs.

She noted that to overcome the drawbacks and shortcomings of the CRC, the Federation promoted the development and adoption of Electronic Citizen Report Cards (eCRC), as a more institutionalized initiative promoted by the Councils. This factor will guarantee the legitimacy of the tool and also the continuity and sustainability of the implementations and the use of the results.

The eCRC uses mobile tables and a custom developed Android app for survey and reporting over some of the local government services such as: water and solid waste management, street lighting, mother & childcare, cemetery, parks, libraries, etc. The tool provides accurate, immediate and geo-referenced results and with offering the possibility to track changes over time. It comes from a simple but powerful approach to understand citizens' priorities and needs, provide credible, neutral and representative information about municipal services, helps local government leaders to respond effectively to issues, builds trust between citizens and government as well as help track performance of individual services.

She acknowledged that the eCRC's core methodology significantly streamlines the survey process, saving local authorities valuable resources without sacrificing data quality. Additionally, she reported that survey enumerators have visited over 13,000 households in Central, Eastern, Northern and Southern Provinces and in less than two years since the project's inception, the eCRC is deployed in 14 of Sri Lanka's largest local governments. Finally, she listed the different challenges faced such as resource limitation, as not all councils have enough human and financial resources to implement eCRC, low interest of the higher levels of bureaucracy on new technology, and the need to creation and adaptation to the legal and regulatory process to institutionalize the process.



The social impact of the action of LABCapital in Bogotá (Colombia) was presented by **Juan Felipe Yepes González**, Coordinator of the Laboratory for the innovation of the public management.

The Veeduría Distrital is a preventive control entity of the City of Bogotá, whose function is to generate alerts to the mayor on issues of administrative inefficiencies and corruption risks. As part of this work, the Veeduría has created a Laboratory for innovation in public management (Lab Capital) that aims not only to inform about the red flags but also to accompany the process

of solving these problems through innovation. As a result, Lab Capital was created in August 2016 with the purpose of providing the local administration of Bogotá with innovative ideas, methodologies, tools and good practices that affect the cycle of public policies taking into account the voice of the citizens.

With this approach, they move from the design of public policies characterized by the separation between citizens and the public sector, to a model where citizens and public servants design, monitor and follow the cycle of public policies. This approach is based on the idea that the public servant is also a citizen, that being within the administration can be a factor of change and contribute in a more effective way to the solution of the problems.

Under this concept, the laboratory has three specific lines of work: strengthening, promotion and evaluation of public policies. In the area of strengthening, the Laboratory promotes a space called "Mesa de Apoyo" (Support Desk), where citizens and public servants can work on innovative solutions to problems that the city has, seeking to incubate these solutions in a collaborative way, providing tools, and later analyzing its possible implementation.

The work on promotion is developed through a benchmark of good practices, identifying trends in innovation, generating knowledge products (innovation guides) and training public servants to develop innovative tools to solve problems. Finally, the Laboratory works in the development of innovative tools related to the evaluation of public policies. According to his words, although the topic of evaluation may generate little interest in the beginning, the citizen would be more interested in following this process if they knew how much resources were invested by local governments in it (Only the city of Bogotá spends seven Million euros per year in the evaluation of public policies).

The importance of public policy evaluation lies in the fact that the cycle of public policy-making starts (or should start) from evaluation. Evaluation allows one to know if the policy is working, what needs to be improved, what good practices can be replicated, and mainly, what mistakes can be avoided so that the offer of services provided by a public entity to citizens improve. However, the Laboratory identified that there is a gap around public policy evaluations regarding participation. In this regard, the Laboratory took on the challenge of working on this issue in order to make evaluation a more efficient and, above all, a participatory process that would improve the management of public policies and, in turn, help strengthen public confidence in public management.

According to Yepes, the Laboratory's challenge is to make the evaluation process attractive to citizens and boost the value of the public resources that are invested in this process. Consequently, the Laboratory is working on the development of an innovative tool with a participatory approach, so that citizens can help in the formulation and monitoring of the recommendations of the public policy evaluations.

The project, which is under development and will be launched in 2018, will develop an information platform where citizens can access public policy assessments on different topics, will review the recommendations made in these assessments, ask the people or the entities that developed them, and follow-up to see if the recommendations had any subsequent impact. Citizens can also upload photos and videos to geo-reference the places where this public policy evaluation has been carried out and which sectors have been taken into account.

This platform aims to generate a monitoring mechanism by the citizens, seeking that this engagement will help entities to be more careful and efficient when contracting evaluations and when using the information that comes out of these public policy assessments. Before ending his speech, he mentioned that this initiative will also serve to raise awareness and inform the citizens and public servants about the value in terms of resources and the importance of evaluation as a tool to improve service delivery and development of the city.

To give participants an overview of an initiative for cities promoted by the private sector, **José Antonio Ondiviela**, Government Solutions Director for Europe of Microsoft, shared some proposals developed by Microsoft to help local governments measuring the city's performance while bringing citizens closer to city management.



For starters, he commented on four technological megatrends that local governments must know in order to innovate and communicate better with their citizens:

- 1) Massive use mobile technology - by 2017, smartphones and tables will be used by 1.5 billion of citizens around the world).
- 2) Massive use of social networks - the use of social networks is huge with younger generations, which implies an opportunity taking into account that the millennial generation will be the 75% of the European workforce by 2025.
- 3) Massive use of cloud computing solutions - as for 2016, 80% of organization worldwide re using or investigating about it.
- 4) Big data explosion - digital content will grow to 18ZB by 2017 (up more so 700% from 2011).

Cities are currently in the process of opening and "sensorizing" their processes, getting a massive amount of information from the citizens. The challenge is for these cities to process this information in a way in which it can improve its services, having an impact on citizens' lives.

Considering the context, he outlined four key actions that are based in the use of new technologies and that can help in the objective of improving the way cities relate to their citizens:

- 1) Empower government employees to better collaborate across departments and increase productivity and efficiency. City servants, have to start working closer to the citizen. A change of paradigm where the official is the one who approaches the citizen can have positive effects in the organizational efficiency of the local government administration. With the new technologies, telework and mobile work force become a great opportunity to give better services and much closer to the citizen. He further mentions an experience in Hollans Kroon (The Netherlands) where the city transformed its organizational structure completely and deployed cloud solutions.
- 2) Engage the citizens through mobile services to better connect government business and people. Telematics services given to citizens are not always personalized with the information that the citizen wants. Every citizen is different and depending of its profile (entrepreneur, student, unemployed, etc.) the information and request will be different. Therefore, the city has to personalize that information and give a more tailor-made service to respond to the citizen needs. Tools like the Cloud business processes and citizens services can enable the local government to better understand citizens need, increase citizen reach and personalize citizens' services to improve their satisfaction. Examples of the use and benefits of this approach can be seen in cities like Barcelona and Copenhagen.
- 3) Optimize the government operations through connected systems, data and people. The use of cloud-enable data centers has given the possibility to local governments to gain actionable insights of citizen's needs, increase the efficiency in its operations and to improve the accessibility to information. Cities have modernized and consolidated the public ICT infrastructure and services to take the pulse of what is happening in the city and to be permanently connected, listening, analyzing and responding to what citizens demand. These interventions have also fostered the way cities are using new technologies to be transparent but most importantly to communicate this to the citizens in a way they can understand and use it. The portal of transparency of the city council of Santander is a great example.
- 4) Transform the government services to drive innovation and growth and control data service to support public sector decision-making processes. There is a massive amount of data that cities can use for all types of public services. This data, coming from sensors, social networks, etc., can be used to attract new talent and business to the city and to foster research and innovation. Examples of different tools such as Dashboards was also illustrated.

## SESSION 4 - INNOVATIVE SOLUTIONS TO INCREASE LOCAL CAPACITIES IN THE FIGHT AGAINST CORRUPTION



The last thematic session aimed to foster the debate on how cities present a very distinctive and strategically important dimension of the fight against corruption and counted with experiences from Mexico. Transparency International Slovakia also shared the work they are doing in supporting the fight against corruption at the local level.

The session started with the presentation “Success and challenges in the implementation of the Integral City Management Platform” by **Mario Roberto Arauz Abarca**, Director of Government innovation of Guadalajara City (Mexico).

Guadalajara is the second megalopolis in Mexico with 1.5 million habitants. The metropolitan area has 4.5 million people distributed in nine municipalities.

The local government of Guadalajara has made important efforts to foster transparency in its fight against corruption with for main strategies:

- 1) Open data - strategy to make local government information primarily accessible.
- 2) Accessible performance and infrastructure information – through the development of “[El Mapa de Guadalajara](#)”, a site that made information about infrastructure available so it can be understood for its habitants in terms of indicators and performance.
- 3) Enhanced citizen participation - Guadalajara has 14 mechanisms of participation that promote the involvement of its citizens in local decisions.
- 4) Improved Management System – through the Integral City Management Platform.

Supported by Bloomberg Philanthropies, the Integral City Management Platform is a tool for citizen and governmental control in order to make clear all urban development processes. The initiative was developed as a way to solve a problem of corruption generated by the chaos around discretionary permits over territory and the anachronistic urban planning.

The platform allows potential developers to consult documents regarding regulation and information about the surroundings of their interested grounds, but most importantly, it allows them to the legal permit required



to build. All permits granted will be available online and people would be able to consult, audit and demand any suspicious activity.

He finished this presentation by enumerating some of the challenges found, such as the lack of digitalized public services, the resistance to change and the difficulties of communication and socialization with the citizens.

Following that presentation, **Gabriel Sipos**, Executive Director of Transparency International Slovakia presented his work on tools to monitor and report corruption in cities. Slovakia counts corruption as one of its biggest problems (7th worst country in Europe according to Transparency International Corruption Index). This scenario has been possible due a dysfunctional police and prosecution systems (fostering impunity); the historical disengaged public (lack of interest of the citizens in public affairs); and weak democratic practices due to the transition from communism.

According to Sipos, in order to solve these issues, Slovakia has tried a few solutions to some extent:

- 1) promoting citizens control by having documents and public documents online e.g. from contract to receipts;
- 2) measuring transparency ranking of municipalities;
- 3) promoting public awareness raising activities to educate citizens on how to be involved in the local fight against corruption;
- 4) ranking local media regarding access, analyzing and benchmarking information;
- 5) involving mayor and deputies in anti-corruption initiatives;
- 6) analyzing public documents and helping to start local watchdogs.

He concluded by highlighting four aspects that can help improve the work of Slovakian cities in the fight against corruption: (i) more investment in transparency initiatives by national government; (ii) more robust decentralization system; (iii) improved access to information, making sure data is not only published but most importantly readable; and (iv) better channels of communication with citizens.

**Roberto Morassut**, MP and Vice-president of the Investigative Committee about the decay of peripheral areas of Italian Parliament, sent his presentation on “The challenge of corruption for an Italian local government” that was delivered by Claudio Signorini.

He explained the context of corruption in Italy and how it is developed through its history affecting both public and private sectors. The weakness of the political parties and the personal economic interest affects all the levels of corruption in the central and local governments, this being reinforced by no-updated regulations.

He further highlighted the experience of the design, elaboration and approval of the urban plan of the city of Rome between 2001 and 2008. After 40 years, the local government of Rome took the decision of updating its urban plan to better respond to citizens’ needs. The plan was design under very strict transparency conditions and counting on an impressive citizen participation. Signorini mentioned this was possible due to the high levels of competency, diligence and honesty of the local government at the time. He concluded by stressing the three reforms needed in Italy in order to fight the central and local corruption, which include i) an Institutional reform; ii) an Electoral reform; and iii) a reform in the Justice system.

## 5. WORKING GROUPS

Participants had a chance to work in groups to analyze two perspectives in which innovative solutions could help foster the transparency and accountability in municipal management. The goal of both groups was to detail the important actions, instruments and concerns that should be considered for each perspective and identify key messages to be shared. Participants divided up by choosing the theme they wanted to work with, and later a representative of each group summarized their conclusion in a plenary.

### INNOVATIVE SOLUTIONS FOR CITIZEN ENGAGEMENT IN FIGHTING CORRUPTION



Facilitated by **Carmen Mayoral**, from the Spanish Federation of Municipalities and Provinces (FEMP), the group debated strategies for citizen engagement in fighting corruption with the contribution of 30 participants. The discussion departed from a common ground: a shared worrying about corruption and the need to eradicate it. The group recognized that corruption existed in every country to a greater or lesser extent.

The discussion showed that public administrations are willing to address the challenge, that they are very motivated and that new paradigms and policies (as those regarding open government) are opening new opportunities for fighting corruption. However, certain degree of frustration were also identified, as long as impact and results are still limited and insufficient, after years of efforts and actions.

The group discussed around the role of different stakeholders regarding corruption, the existing legislative tools, the importance of new technologies and finally the key existing drivers to end with corruption.

Regarding the role of different key stakeholders to fight corruption, the group discussed about the role of citizenship, policy-makers and other agents.

- Firstly, regarding citizenship, the discussion pointed to the need to empower citizens and to build co-responsibility; outlined the need to break passivity; the need to make citizenship the key control mechanism; and the need to make more specific focus on the youth in order to reconnect them with institutions.
- Secondly, regarding policy-makers, the debate pointed to the importance of creating active leadership, in order to have competent, honest and reliable leaders; to fulfill political compromises; and to make policy-makers trust their citizens by opening spaces for participation.

- Thirdly, regarding other agents, the group outlined the importance of media and of public workers, public managers and directives.

The group also discussed about law and legislation. Spanish participants pointed that they have a very strict and demanding legislation, but they also have problems in applying it, given the limited resources at their disposal. However, they also pointed out that there is space for improving the law: for example, limiting the time that representatives can be in power, including more specific mechanisms for punishing corruption, better protecting public officers when they denounce corruption.

SMART technologies were also a point of discussion. The importance and impact as well as the possibilities introduced by these technologies were outlined. These together with globalization, are however introducing new complexities in public management that have to be addressed. The discussion ended with the identification of key drivers for fighting corruption: improving transparency and accountability; increasing participation in policy-making and in budgeting; and promoting good governance.

## INNOVATIVE SOLUTIONS FOR MUNICIPAL FINANCES AND PUBLIC SERVICES



This group's discussion was, facilitated by **Jean Francois Habeau** from FMDV, they discussed on local finance and of its connections with topics such as smart technologies, participation or accountability.

The group discussed specific innovative experiences that illustrated these connections, as well as its potentialities. Examples came from different countries and related to different issues around local financing:

- For instance, In Ecuador, some municipalities have increased their revenues by 80% by using smart technologies in tax collection.
- In The Philippines, these technologies have been used for land management to make it more transparent.
- In Uganda, local payment of public services by using mobile phone multiplied revenues by 300%.
- In Morocco, managing building permits using smart technologies have allowed to simplify processes, avoid possible future conflicts of property and denounce projects, which are not accomplishing urban plans.
- Cities in Cyprus are using electronic billing and systems of procurement, which have dramatically simplified processes.

Some of the participants recalled the importance of peer-to-peer learning and of collaboration between cities to share experiences and technologies. There is also a call for the role of private companies and the importance of public-private collaborations. Uraía has a number of publications and a web in which a number of experiences can be shared.

## DEBATE: KEY MESSAGES AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Following the presentations of the various topics highlighted in the working groups, participants were given the floor to debate and make recommendations on the topic. Several key messages emerged, including the following:

- The risk of over-reliance on technology and the importance of building close relations between representatives and citizens, beyond technology and by building personal contact. However, there is no doubt that technology can improve accessibility to elected representatives, especially in big cities. Direct participation in small meetings and on-line participation can be complementary.
- Accessibility to representatives is of key importance. It is true that good salaries for local officials are important for avoiding corruption, but sometimes, reduced salaries or even voluntary work is not a problem, as it occurs in the US in small towns. Even with low salaries, when representatives are very accessible corruption is reduced, as accountability is stronger.
- Corruption affects both political and technical staff in local governments. “Technical” corruption has to be strictly controlled: For example, building just one more store than allowed in a building can be a symptom of corruption of technical staff.
- Local governments should assess their own administrative structures in order to identify which departments are more prone to risk regarding corruption (for example, urban planning or procurement), in order to address prevention mechanisms.
- Cities are not planned by urbanists or architects any more, but also by sociologists, environmental engineers, economists, and the citizens. The role of different disciplines and a good balance between technical knowledge and citizen participation is of key importance.
- The local level is the privileged sphere in order to promote participatory democracy and to build close relations between representatives and citizens, as they share spaces and service, and can go in direct conversations.
- Local governments have also to assume the current context characterized by limited economic growth and of high unemployment.
- Building trust in the local public administration is essential for development, it is important to acknowledge that this cannot be possible without improving communication with citizens on the one hand, and without eradicating corrupt and ineffective practices on the other, especially those affecting the provision of basic services that have a direct impact on the daily lives of citizens.

## 4. SPECIAL SESSIONS

### FOCUS IN SPAIN: A POLITICAL VISION ABOUT THE CHALLENGES OF OPEN LOCAL GOVERNMENT



The session gave an opportunity for two Spanish Mayors, from different political background and city characteristically, to share their vision about the challenges of open local government in the Spanish context, sharing their advances, concerns and lessons learnt with regard to these issues. A Mayor from the United States facilitated the debate, giving a political perspective from a different context and enriching the discussion.

**Karen Freeman-Wilson**, Mayor of Gary, Indiana, (USA) and Second Vice-president of the National League of Cities acted as a moderator for this session, convened the meeting by commenting on how accessibility provides a platform for transparency. She emphasized that there are various mechanisms to engage citizens and make them feel as if they were part of government. However, when local governments decide to act on this decision, expectations for services raise hence local governments should be prepared in making efforts and searching for the right alternatives to meet these expectations.

She recognized that when public servants abuse public trust, local governments should make that visible and hold them accountable, because when government is undermined, citizens become cynical, jaded, and less likely to trust and engage, eroding the possibility of any fruitful interactions diminishing the legitimacy of the local government itself.

**Gema Igual**, Mayor of Santander and Uraía founding member, started by explaining the current Spanish context where local governments had to face the challenges and consequences of the recent economic crisis by changing in some cases, the core productive system of the city and by planning strategically. In the case of Santander, the bet was on innovation and culture as drivers of city development, as set in their Strategic Plan 2010-2020.

She then focused on the axis of innovation. The city of Santander counts on an innovation plan that works from the premise that SMART technologies is a basic part of the citizens daily lives and that citizens are not only consumers of the measures taken by the government but also producers of those measures. She stressed that SMART Technologies and innovation have represented an opportunity to consolidate governance in two directions: one, by attending citizens' requests and needs and the other to consolidate a future model for the city. SMART technologies have allowed the city to receive immediate reaction to the proposals and local action facilitating a direct dialogue with the citizens.



By using SMART technologies in the city management, the local government has managed to facilitate the understanding and implementation of policies, to fasten the responses to gaps and failures of some specific interventions and to promote the development collaborative actions to improve service provision. Consequently, they have been working to build an intelligent, innovative and participatory city. With new models of governance, the city has reconfigured public services to respond to citizens demands and has consolidated a model of co-creation through participatory innovation.

In 2010, the city started the project SMART Santander, which implied a big effort by the local government to help citizens understand the concept and value it. Several initiatives put into place had a good impact because nowadays citizens are used to these channels of communication and use new technologies. This strategy raised the commitment of listening to the citizens.

Building up on the good results and intending to lead the SMART Cities scenario at the global level, Santander became an urban lab. Therefore, the city specialized in sensors measuring everything, which gave them a big amount of data to share with companies, academia and citizens and also to allow the city itself to develop research and experimentation. The city counts with 20.000 sensors divided in two types: (i) statics – used in parks to measure humidity, pollution, noise, etc. and (ii) participatory, in which citizens tell the government what to do, from what they see around the city. Before concluding, she underlined that transparency is what politicians have to do, communicating, before during and after the policy process.

In his presentation **David Lucas**, Mayor of Mostoles, President of the IMPULSO network and Spokesperson for E-government of the Council of European Municipalities and Regions, shared the experience of his city and also explained the work that several local government networks are doing to promote the need for local open government at national as well as at the global level.



He stated that citizen trust in public actions and institutions is deteriorating due to the lack of transparency, participation, and accountability. The later situation and the economic crisis, made it evident for the citizens that the solutions offered by the governments did not solve any of their problems. This has produced a sense of detachment of citizens from their institutions and a separation between representative and participatory democracy. Mayors have the responsibility to regain the trusts of citizens by establishing open processes to make the citizen the center of policy action.

The city of Mostoles have made several efforts to counteract these challenges: like fostering the decentralization of decision making and developing participatory budgeting, establishing participatory processes and facilitating the use of SMART technologies to improve the accessibility to information.

Mayor Lucas also described the work done through the Spanish Federation of Municipalities and Provinces in promoting open government and transparency initiatives.

The Federation has supported the development of three main instruments:

- 1) The template of an Ordinance of transparency to access to public information; which has been distributed to all 8.000 Spanish municipalities and approved by a great number of them.
- 2) The Good Government Code, a commitment made by local governments to be more transparent and eliminate the practices of corruption at local level.

- 3) The Network of transparency and participation through sharing good practices and lessons learned. The networks has 237 local governments as members involving almost 21 million citizens.

With these instruments and through its work in the area, the FEMP aims to act as an articulating and co-creating actor in the aim of fostering transparency, participation and accountability in local public management.

Additionally, Lucas believed it was important to mention the different networks of local governments that are working in the area. There are different thematic networks also, for example those related to the ICT as the network impulse that aims to help governments to adapt their municipalities to the challenges of ICT, public purchasing, reference models.

Finally, he mentioned the work done in the Council of European Municipalities and Regions, this is very important for the coordination of the different federations of municipalities of different countries that share experiences that are valuable in the articulation of public services. He mentioned that one of the major challenges is to address a digital gap in Europe and the need to work towards reducing it, with the aim of increasing citizen participation. Additionally, he believed that the Council should foster the transition of the models of e-government to models of open government where transparency and citizen participation are fundamental elements of local political actions.

**Mayor Freeman-Wilson**, concluded the session by giving her perspective on the American context. She stated that there is a need that citizens are more engaged not just voting but engaged in the actual decisions that are made by the government. One of the ways this can happen is to give citizens access to the information. According to her, it is important to allow them to participate in the decision making, it does not mean that they have the final say, but to share concerns is important to shape policies, whether it is budgets, a new project, economic development, and the more citizens feel engaged in decision making the better for the development of the city. The presentation made clear that cities have a responsibility to the citizens they serve, what we are conveying is that we do not want to hide, is necessary to meet the citizens, to get acquainted with their needs.



## SMART GEEKS: TECHNOLOGICAL APPLICATIONS FOR CITIES

A final plenary opened a space to present city applications and tools. Three different initiatives were presented showing how specific demands have turned into new products and services available to the citizens.

**César Silva**, CEO of Change Tomorrow, started the round of presentations showing his work on participatory budget through a tool called “Participare”. He described Participatory Budgeting (PB) as a methodology of direct democracy where citizens give ideas, deliberate over proposals and decide by voting. According to him, participatory budgeting is a process “made by people for people”. Since it is a process and not recipe, it has to be put in context in order to get better results. Participatory budgeting helps to strengthen accountability by allowing citizens to see what the money is used for; it builds trust and closes the gap between citizens and local governments; improves citizens’ knowledge on local policies; improves monitoring by allowing a space for transparency, creates direct impact on the daily lives and can increase social mobilization.



PBs are not just a specific intervention, rather has to be seen as a bigger process where you can evaluate the past condition, analyze its execution and evaluate the impacts afterwards in terms of costs, people and sustainability.

The platform counts with specific features for the making all the information available regarding the process (promotion campaigns, deadlines, description of the proposals, on-line and off-line gatherings, voting mechanisms and results) to keep the citizen informed and engaged. The platform also provides a tool for citizen monitoring and the possibility to summarize the full process.

He gave an example of Ovar (Portugal), where the city has implemented the methodology since 2014 with great success. In this regard, the local government not only uses the online features but also makes efforts to involve citizens through other off-line mechanisms making the process more available. They have faced some challenges but have adjusted the methodology in order to get better results gaining the trust of their citizens in the process. Replication of the methodology has been done in other Portuguese municipalities (Sabugal, Valondo, Guimaraes, Águeda) and with very good results. The city of Edinburg (Scotland) has worked on the methodology for the past 10 years but recently switched to the digital version in 2016. This represented challenges in terms of training of both administration and citizens.

Finally, he commented that the main factors for success are proper engagement of the citizens, inclusion and commitment from politicians and local government staff. He also identified some of the risks such as failed execution (no deliveries means no citizens trust in the process), process “hostage” (subjects that usually dominate the process need to be identified and controlled), Lobbies (between regions, communities, groups) and bad communication.

**José Ignacio Pastor Pérez**, Chief of Service, Transparency and open government of the Valencia City Council presented some of the actions and tools of the city’s main transparency strategy called “Soms Clars”.

He started by explaining the political and social context of Spain, referring to the latest survey of the Sociological Research Center (CIS), which reflected an increase in the bad perception that citizens have of the public sector. At the social level, he mentioned the emergence of different processes of social mobilization in Spain in recent years, which brought further demand for transparency and for a change in the relationship between citizens and elected representatives.



Moreover, for the specific case of Valencia, he acknowledged that during the last decade, the city and its administration have been involved in sound cases of corruption that included political leaders, public officials, political parties, etc. In this context, 2015 brought in a new government that has one of its main priorities is the fight against corruption, the promotion of transparency and open government and citizen participation.

The initiatives of the city of Valencia in regards to the promotion of transparency and the fight against corruption are based on an existing regulatory framework that includes the Transparency Law (Law 19 of 2013) at the national level, the Autonomous Law of the Valencian Community (Law 2 of 2015) recently created a Code of Ethics for Good Governance.

As part of this work, the city promoted the "Open Door Municipality" campaign, an initiative of the mayor and the entire government team consisting of opening the doors of the City Council, in addition to visit of its facilities. The city has also promoted a series of online participatory processes in the neighborhoods, where citizens can propose and vote those initiatives that they consider of interest for their neighborhood or in the case of being a general consultation for their city. It also uses the public application of the City Council, *AppValencia*, to inform the calls of the processes as a further channel of communication with the citizen. Additionally, a Chair of Open Government has been created with the Polytechnic University of Valencia, where the citizens can participate.

Furthermore, the city also decided to establish a single online access point for the citizens to access the information and tools for communication with its local administration, following an integrated model of open government. [Valencia's open government portal](#) is an online point for access for the citizen to consult information about their local administration, reuse open data to contribute to the city and citizens with innovative solutions, and to participate in the decisions of the city.

He commented on the new developments done in the portal related to the visualization of the economic data. The new functionality allows for multiple visualizations and it features a calculator for citizen use and a budget analyzer. Budgets from previous years are compared and the execution (staff costs, civil servants, etc.) of the one in force is seen. All information is available to any citizen, researcher or journalist.

He concluded by highlighting that this latest feature combines the talent and contributions from a local private enterprise and from the citizens (civic Hackers).

A final presentation was given by **José Antonio Ondiviela**, Government Solutions Director for Europe of Microsoft introducing a free-access tool promoted by Microsoft. The speaker commented that today many cities want to implement SMART strategies but do not know where to start. With a wide supply of solutions and tools and a wide range of things to do, local governments wanting to start or deepen their SMART strategies should begin by thinking (or by asking themselves) the current level of "smartness" of the city (strengths or weaknesses) and the final goal that they would like to achieve.

The SMART City Maturity Assessment Tool, which is based on the work developed by Microsoft, IDC, Booz & Allen, among others, aims to address "How SMART is your Smart City?". The assessment is done to eight selected city areas including government administration, health care education, public safety and security, urban planning, transportation, energy and water and culture and tourism; Through 6 check proxies such as: vision, leadership, serving community, project management, innovation and data leverage. Scoring 1 to 5 questions for each function, the tool provides the final maturity status by city function and of the entire city. The results will help the cities to identify the areas that need intervention or change and to prioritize resources and actions. The application is free of charge and is ideal for accounting planning, identifying priorities, best incumbent partners and even funding opportunities. The tool has already been tested in different cities like Barcelona.

## 7. CLOSING REMARKS AND PRESENTATION OF URBAN-GLASS

**Diana López Caramazana, Jean François Habeau, and Juana López Pagán**, wrapped up the workshop by bringing back the relevance of the discussions on transparency and citizen engagement for improving municipal management in the current context where SMART technologies can be used as a citizenship tool.

Furthermore, they thanked the effort made by participants to attend this face to-face meeting and bringing to the table active examples as well as the instruments used.

The partners were informed that the workshop was part of a series of a needs assessment on what local government were requesting in addition to what they are developing regarding transparency and accountability in urban management including a new initiative called “[Urban - GLASS](#)” (Global-Local Accountability Support System).

The initiative addresses the increased need for local governments around the world to connect with their citizenship in a renewed way with the final objective of being more efficient in the delivery of basic services, increasing the participation in public management and rebuilding the trust of the public sector at local level.

The objective is to support local governments to implement innovative mechanisms to ensure transparency and accountability in city management, preventing corruption and establishing new channels of communication with their citizens.

The initiative has created partnership that includes UN-Habitat, FEMP, United Cities and Local Governments Middle-East and West Asia Section (UCLG-MEWA), the Commonwealth Local Government Forum (CLGF), Global fund for the development of cities FMDV, the Ibero-American Secretariat (SEGIB), working in close cooperation with Transparency International.

Besides the network, the initiative has managed to include the topics of transparency and accountability in urban management in the global agenda by organizing and supporting a series of awareness raising events during the last two years; in order to foster and support a community of practice on “Transparent and open local governments” created in the framework of UCLG.

In Conclusion, Carlos Martínez Minguéz, Mayor of Soria (Spain) and vice-president of FEMP, on behalf of FEMP, praised the quality of the contributions from experts and recalled the commitment of the institution to support UN-Habitat in particular the Uraía Platform in the development of these series of meetings aiming to foster knowledge, innovation and practical experiences about transparency issues.